

<span id="page-0-0"></span>Received 3 June 2024, accepted 3 July 2024, date of publication 8 July 2024, date of current version 18 July 2024.

*Digital Object Identifier 10.1109/ACCESS.2024.3424907*

# **IN RESEARCH ARTICLE**

# Proposal and Definition of an Intelligent Decision-Support System Based on Deep Learning Techniques for the Management of Possible COVID-19 Cases in Patients Attending Emergency Departments

# DOLORES CORB[A](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1239-5276)CHO-ABELAIRA®1,[2](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1494-8145), MANUEL CASAL-GUISANDE®2,3, FERNANDO CORBACHO-ABELAIRA<sup>4</sup>, MIGUEL ARNAIZ-FERNÁNDEZ<sup>4</sup>, CARMEN TRINIDAD-LÓPEZ<sup>5</sup>, CARLOS DELGADO SÁNCHEZ-[GR](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9927-7453)ACIÁN<sup>5</sup>, MANUEL SÁNCHEZ-MONTAÑÉS<sup>6</sup>, ALBERTO RUANO-RAVIÑA<sup>07,8,9</sup>, AND ALBERTO FERNÁNDEZ-VILLAR2,10,11

<sup>1</sup> Pulmonary Department, Hospital Ribera Povisa, 36211 Vigo, Spain

<sup>2</sup>NeumoVigo I+i Research Group, Instituto de Investigación Sanitaria Galicia Sur (IIS Galicia Sur), SERGAS-UVIGO, 36213 Vigo, Spain

<sup>3</sup>Fundación Pública de Investigación Biomédica Galicia Sur, Hospital Álvaro Cunqueiro, 36312 Vigo, Spain

<sup>4</sup>Cognodata Consulting, 28046 Madrid, Spain

<sup>5</sup>Radiology Department, Hospital Ribera Povisa, 36211 Vigo, Spain

<sup>6</sup>Department of Computer Science, Escuela Politécnica Superior, Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, 28049 Madrid, Spain

<sup>7</sup>Department of Preventive Medicine and Public Health, Universidade de Santiago de Compostela, 15705 Santiago de Compostela, Spain <sup>8</sup>CIBERESP ISCIII, 28029 Madrid, Spain

<sup>9</sup>Health Research Institute of Santiago de Compostela (IDIS), 15706 Santiago de Compostela, Spain

<sup>10</sup>Pulmonary Department, Hospital Álvaro Cunqueiro, 36312 Vigo, Spain

<sup>11</sup>CIBERES ISCIII, 28029 Madrid, Spain

Corresponding author: Manuel Casal-Guisande (manuel.casal.guisande@uvigo.es)

This work was supported by the Cognodata Consulting, Universidad Autónoma de Madrid (UAM), and Hospital Povisa funded by red.es (NextGenerationEU funds) for the execution of the project titled ''In-Silico Medicine Con Sistemas Generativos de Inteligencia Artificial y Schema-Based Machine Learning: Pilotos en Enfermedades Infecciosas'' (In-Silico Medicine with Generative AI and Schema-Based Learning: Pilots in Infectious Diseases) under Grant 2021/C005/00145600.

This work involved human subjects or animals in its research. Approval of all ethical and experimental procedures and protocols was granted by the Ethics Committee of Galicia under Protocol No. 2020/271, and performed in line with the Declaration of Helsinki.

**ABSTRACT** The COVID-19 pandemic drastically transformed the integration of technology into medicine, testing the ability of health systems to make quick and effective decisions. This has been especially noticeable in emergency departments, which were overwhelmed by the massive influx of patients. In this context, this article presents the design, development, and proof of concept of a new intelligent decision support system applied to the management of patients suspected of having COVID-19 upon their arrival at an emergency department. To achieve this, starting from our proprietary database of chest X-rays (CXRs) collected at the Ribera Povisa Hospital, two modules based on the use of convolutional neural networks (CNNs) were sequentially run. The first was based on the DenseNet-121 model to identify whether a pneumonia condition was presented in the CXR, while the second was based on the COVID-Net CXR-S model and aimed to quantify the severity of airspace opacity in the CXR on a scale 0–24. Thus, based on this architecture, it will be possible to make predictions based on the CXR of new patients that, after interpretation, might allow physicians to determine whether cases are high-risk and, for example, should be admitted to the intensive care unit. Although the results we obtained were encouraging, it is important to note that this proposal is still

The associate editor coordinating the review o[f thi](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0026-2284)s manuscript and approving it for publication was Vivek Kumar Sehgal.

at a conceptual stage of development and so future work will be required to validate it in real environments and develop techniques that can help explain its results.

**INDEX TERMS** Artificial intelligence, convolutional neural networks, decision making, deep learning, decision support systems.

# **I. INTRODUCTION**

<span id="page-1-4"></span><span id="page-1-2"></span><span id="page-1-1"></span><span id="page-1-0"></span>The COVID-19 pandemic posed a considerable challenge to healthcare systems [\[1\],](#page-9-0) [\[2\],](#page-9-1) [\[3\],](#page-9-2) [\[4\]. Th](#page-9-3)ese situations highlighted the need to seek a balance between efficient resource management and safe decision making, even in the initial stages of disease when the tools and knowledge required to achieve this were not available. In particular, it is relevant to highlight the pressure experienced by the emergency services [\[5\], w](#page-9-4)hich were overloaded on numerous occasions because of the high number of patients, shortage of beds, and especially by the lack of agile decision-making processes. All the above highlights the need to design specific tools that allow patients with more severe disease to be identified, thereby facilitating decisions regarding hospitalisation and even admission to the intensive care unit (ICU). In this context, thoracic imaging techniques are already widely used in emergency departments to evaluate the possible severity of COVID-19-associated pneumonia [\[6\],](#page-9-5) [\[7\],](#page-9-6) [\[8\]. H](#page-9-7)owever, quantification of disease extent is subject to interobserver variation, nonspecific interpretation, and understudied correlations with clinical outcomes. In addition, many radiologists find it difficult to diagnose the presence of coronavirus because it is difficult to differentiate between pneumonia caused by COVID-19 and other types of illnesses.

<span id="page-1-21"></span><span id="page-1-20"></span><span id="page-1-19"></span><span id="page-1-18"></span><span id="page-1-12"></span><span id="page-1-11"></span><span id="page-1-10"></span><span id="page-1-9"></span><span id="page-1-8"></span>Generally speaking, various tools and mechanisms have been developed in the health field in recent years aimed at facilitating and streamlining arduous decision-making processes [\[9\],](#page-9-8) [\[10\],](#page-9-9) [\[11\],](#page-9-10) [\[12\],](#page-9-11) [\[13\],](#page-9-12) [\[14\],](#page-9-13) [\[15\],](#page-9-14) [\[16\],](#page-9-15) [\[17\],](#page-9-16) [\[18\],](#page-9-17) [\[19\],](#page-9-18) [\[20\],](#page-9-19) [\[21\],](#page-9-20) [\[22\]. T](#page-9-21)hese tools are commonly known as decision support systems (DSS), and it is now increasingly common for them to integrate techniques from the field of artificial intelligence (AI). Several unique proposals have already been presented specifically regarding COVID-19, many of them focused on image analysis. In this sense, the development of AI techniques focused on image processing is increasingly common and promising and can be of great help in the field of radiology [\[23\],](#page-9-22) [\[24\],](#page-9-23) [\[25\],](#page-9-24) [\[26\].](#page-9-25)

<span id="page-1-29"></span><span id="page-1-28"></span><span id="page-1-27"></span><span id="page-1-26"></span><span id="page-1-22"></span>Focusing expressly on COVID-19, it is worth highlighting various proposals supported by the use of deep learning (DL) techniques [\[27\],](#page-9-26) [\[28\], e](#page-9-27)specially convolutional neural networks (CNNs), which are very useful for image analysis. For example, Narin et al. [\[29\]](#page-9-28) used five models based on pre-trained CNNs, including ResNet50, which demonstrated outstanding performance with an accuracy of 96.1% in classifying COVID-19 using X-ray images. Similarly, Sahinbas and Catak [\[30\]](#page-10-0) experimented with five different pretrained models, including VGG16, VGG19, ResNet, DenseNet, and InceptionV3 on a balanced set of 140 X-ray images (70 positive and 70 negative for COVID-19), and achieved <span id="page-1-31"></span><span id="page-1-30"></span><span id="page-1-3"></span>an accuracy of 80% with the VGG16 model. Along these same lines, Medhi et al. [\[31\]](#page-10-1) reported 93% accuracy in detecting COVID-19 using a CNN and a dataset with 150 X-ray images. Likewise, Ozturk et al. [\[32\]](#page-10-2) presented a study to distinguish between patients with and without COVID-19, reaching an average accuracy of 98.08% for the detection of the disease and with average sensitivity, specificity, and F1 score values of 95.13%, 95.30%, and 96.51%, respectively, using DL neural networks and X-ray images. Similarly, Babukarthik et al. [\[33\]](#page-10-3) proposed a model based on Genetic Deep Learning Convolutional Neural Networks (GDCNN) to detect COVID-19, which they built from a set of 5,000 X-ray images obtained from a public repository; these authors achieved an accuracy of 97.23%, with sensitivities and specificities of 98.62% and 97%, respectively.

<span id="page-1-34"></span><span id="page-1-33"></span><span id="page-1-32"></span><span id="page-1-7"></span><span id="page-1-6"></span><span id="page-1-5"></span>In contrast, other specific AI models should also be considered for the generation of severity scores, such as those presented by Li et al. [\[34\]](#page-10-4) and Zhu et al. [\[35\], w](#page-10-5)hich showed an excellent correlation between AI and expert results, reaffirming the feasibility of use and accuracy of AI models in the assessment and monitoring of lung disease severity in COVID-19 cases. These studies not only underline the wide range of current approaches and depth of research in this field, but also highlight the enormous potential and challenges presented by the use of DL and CNN in the classification, quantification, and prediction of disease severity based on lung involvement in COVID-19 cases, in so providing valuable tools to support decision-making in healthcare fields.

<span id="page-1-17"></span><span id="page-1-16"></span><span id="page-1-15"></span><span id="page-1-14"></span><span id="page-1-13"></span>This current work presents the design, development, and proof of concept of a new intelligent decision support system for application in the management of patients suspected of having COVID-19 who attend emergency services. Thus, once a patient has tested positive for COVID-19 and has received chest X-ray (CXR) results, two modules based on DL techniques and focused on the classification of CXRs are deployed. The first one tries to determine if the patient has pneumonia. If this is the case, the second one seeks to determine the associated disease severity by calculating an index score ranging from 0 to 24 points. The deployment of this system is expected to speed up the detection of patient cases that require greater attention, thereby allowing the necessary measures to be taken quickly and efficiently.

<span id="page-1-25"></span><span id="page-1-24"></span><span id="page-1-23"></span>The present article is organised into five sections. Section  $\Pi$ addresses the presentation of the database we employed in this work, presenting the conceptual description of the intelligent system and its implementation through a software artefact. After that, section [III](#page-5-0) presents a case of practical application to exemplify the operation of the system as a proof of concept. In section  $\mathbf{IV}$ , we discuss the results we obtained

<span id="page-2-1"></span>

**FIGURE 1.** Flow chart of the intelligent decision support system.

and finally, section [V](#page-8-0) describes the conclusions obtained and recommended future lines of work.

#### <span id="page-2-0"></span>**II. MATERIALS AND METHODS**

# A. DESCRIPTION OF THE DATABASE

The database used in this study came from the Pulmonology Department of the Ribera Povisa Hospital (Vigo, Galicia, Spain). The study was conducted in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki and approved by the Ethics Committee of Galicia (protocol code 2020/271). The data it contains were collected between March 2020 and February 2021 and include CXRs labelled by two thoracic radiologists with more than 10 years of experience each. The data collection process should be understood as a continuous series of cases in which patients were recruited as they attended the emergency department at our hospital, thereby making our sample representative of the general population. These images belong to patients who had a positive PCR (polymerase chain reaction) test result for COVID-19 upon arrival at the emergency department. Both posteroanterior (PA) and anteroposterior (AP) views were included in this work. Once a CXR is produced, it is saved in Digital Imaging and Communication In Medicine ( $DICOM(\widehat{R})$ ) format and is managed by the Picture Archiving and Communication System (PACS) at the hospital, from where the images were extracted. In our case, the IMPAX PACS was used (version 6.6.1.4024, 2016, Agfa HealthCare N.V., Belgium). The database contained 2,438

images, of which 1,450 were associated with the pneumonia label (59.5%) and 988 with the non-pneumonia label (40.5%). Of these, 533 images were reserved to carry out tests with the first module of the system.

In addition, from the complete collection of images, 200 were randomly selected for analysis with the second system module, which focused on assessing the airspace opacity severity (ASOS). Quantification of ASOS is tedious and impractical given the volume and complexity of the work carried out in the daily practice of radiologists, but nonetheless provides valuable information to evaluate progression and risk stratification. In this case, two expert thoracic radiologists independently assigned each image a severity score based on their visual estimation of the percentage of lung affected by airspace opacity. To structure this evaluation, each lung was divided into six quadrants. The quadrants were scored as follows: 0 for the absence of lesions, 1 for 0–25% involvement, 2 for 25–50%, 3 for 50–75%, and 4 for more than 75% involvement. Thus, the total possible score ranged from 0 to 24  $[36]$ ,  $[37]$ . To consolidate a definitive numerical label for each image, the average of the scores given by the experts was calculated and rounded to the nearest integer.

# <span id="page-2-3"></span><span id="page-2-2"></span>B. CONCEPTUAL DESIGN OF THE SYSTEM

The flow chart in Fig. [1](#page-2-1) presents the different stages of the intelligent system proposed in this work.

*Stage 1 (Initial evaluation and chest X-rays):* The first stage of the proposed system focuses on the initial patient evaluation. Upon arrival at the emergency department, a COVID-19 test is performed and in positive cases, a CXR is then performed, as indicated in Fig. [1.](#page-2-1)

*Stage 2 (Data processing):* After the initial evaluation, if the patient had COVID-19, the CXR is processed by the intelligent system. To do this, two modules based on the use of CNNs are ran sequentially. Prior to the CXR analysis, the images were pretreated by cropping them to omit any areas not belonging to the CXR. This process was carried out with the entire database prior to the training process. In the case of the first module, once the CNN has been trained, it is then possible to analyse the CXR of a new patient. This module output a metric with a value between 0 and 100, referred to as the Pneumonia Risk (PR). After interpreting this value, it is possible to discriminate between patients with and without pneumonia.

If the patient presents pneumonia, we move on to the second system module, which attempts to determine the severity of the pneumonia by quantifying the ASOS. To achieve this, a new CNN called the COVID-Net CXR-S is deployed [\[38\].](#page-10-8) Based on the CXR of the new patient, this process produces a value varying between 0 and 24 according to the associated disease severity detected. In turn, it is important to note that in the future, once the system is validated and enters the production phase, and as new images are collected, it will be advisable to periodically reassess its predictive capacity, scheduling subsequent time to retrain the CNNs.

*Stage 3 (Generation of alerts and decision making):* When faced with a new patient, and if they presented COVID-19, a system output label of pneumonia or non-pneumonia is obtained along with the severity indicator of airspace opacity. Based on this classification, the system implements a series of alerts following the rules established for patient management:

- In cases where pneumonia is not detected, no additional actions are required.
- If the patient presents pneumonia and  $0 <$  ASOS  $<$  5, monitoring is recommended.
- If the patient presents pneumonia and  $5 <$  ASOS  $<$  15, hospitalisation is recommended.
- If the patient presents pneumonia and  $15 <$  ASOS  $<$  24, then they should be admitted to the hospital ICU.

These guidelines allow medical staff to efficiently identify patients requiring priority care, thus optimising the decisionmaking process. It is crucial to note that these rules are also subject to review and adjustment based on new evidence and clinical practices, allowing thresholds and recommendations to be adapted, as necessary.

#### C. SYSTEM IMPLEMENTATION

This section addresses the implementation of the system described in section *B. Conceptual design of the system*. Python (Version 3.7.10) along with the TensorFlow 2.4 library was used to train and test the models. In addition,

<span id="page-3-2"></span>MATLAB˙ (version R2023b, Natick, MA, USA) was used together with the App Designer Toolbox [\[39\]](#page-10-9) to develop a graphical interface that facilitated interaction with the developed models. The model calculations were conducted in the cloud on a machine with 8 virtual CPUs (30 GB RAM) and a NVIDIA T4 GPU. Figure [2](#page-3-0) shows a screenshot of the interface we developed that shows three boxes, with each one relating to the stages previously described in section *B. Conceptual design of the system.*

<span id="page-3-0"></span>

<span id="page-3-1"></span>**FIGURE 2.** Screenshot of the application developed in this work. In panel (1), the CXR to be analysed is selected. In panel (2), the image is processed by the system to determine the risk of pneumonia and, if applicable, the severity of the opacity of the airspace. Finally, panel (3) generates alerts and addresses the associated decision making recommendations.

# 1) INITIAL EVALUATION AND CHEST X-RAYS

The CXR associated with each patient had to be entered into the application through the panel shown in Fig. [2.](#page-3-0) It is important that the images of new patients are obtained under conditions similar to those used in the construction of the system in order to maximise its precision.

# 2) DATA PROCESSING

Once the CXR images from the patient have been uploaded, their treatment is then passed through the system. This treatment is addressed through two modules that run sequentially. The first one deploys a CNN for classification designed to determine whether the patient has pneumonia. While the second deploys a regression CNN that tries to estimate ASOS.

#### *a: MODULE ONE—DIAGNOSTIC*

To define the inference engine of the first module, we started with the set of images mentioned in section *A. Description of the database*. Prior to training the model, all the images were rescaled to satisfy the requirements of the CNN

<span id="page-4-0"></span>



input layer to be used  $(224 \times 224 \times 1)$ . It is important to clarify that the starting images were square, so they were not deformed with scaling. Of the total set of images, 533 (approximately 20% of the starting images) were randomly reserved for testing. Of these, 317 of the patients had pneumonia (59.5%). The remaining images were used in the CNN training process. Of the total number of images in the training set, 15% were reserved for validation in order to facilitate hyperparameter tuning.

To give an example of the operation of the system, we started from the Densenet-121 architecture  $[40]$  that had previously been trained on the ImageNet data set and adapted its output for two classes (pneumonia versus nonpneumonia). The use of a pre-trained network (an approach known as transfer learning) had significant advantages such as reduced training time and smaller data set requirements, given that the network already contained initialised and nonrandom weighting. Although Densenet-121 was chosen in this case, other CNN architectures could be chosen, as long as they provide satisfactory results. Hyperparameter optimisation was performed by conducting preliminary tests to select the best hyperparameters for this specific model. These tests involved experimenting with different learning rates, optimisers, and the number of epochs to identify the combination that yielded the best performance on the validation set. These hyperparameters are summarised in Table [1.](#page-4-0)

After training the model, the PR score is output from the network when it is supplied with new CXRs. This indicator aims to represent the risk of a patient developing pneumonia. Although its true value is between 0 and 1, to facilitate its interpretation it is scaled between 0 and 100. However, a threshold value must be established based on the PR in order to decide if a patient has this condition. To determine this value, we undertook a graphical optimisation similar to that described by Casal-Guisande et al. [\[11\], s](#page-9-10)electing the threshold value that maximises the Matthews correlation coefficient (Mcc) [\[41\],](#page-10-11) [\[42\],](#page-10-12) [\[43\]](#page-10-13) associated with the test set. The Mcc equation is presented in equation  $(1)$ ; the abbreviations used in the equation are as follows:  $TN = true$  negatives,  $FN =$ false negatives,  $TP = true$  positives, and  $FP = false$  positives.

<span id="page-4-6"></span><span id="page-4-5"></span><span id="page-4-4"></span>
$$
Mcc = \frac{TN \cdot TP\text{-FN} \cdot FP}{\sqrt{(TP+FP) \cdot (TP+FN) \cdot (TN+FP) \cdot (TN+FN)}}
$$
 (1)

We chose to use Mcc over other possible metrics such as the precision metric because of its ability to behave appropriately even with unbalanced data sets. In this case, the test set we used presented a slight imbalance, with 59.5% of the patients presenting pneumonia and 40.5% without a pneumonia diagnosis. Fig. [3](#page-4-2) shows the different Mcc values for the different threshold values. The optimal Mcc  $(0.67)$  is presented for a threshold value of 11.

<span id="page-4-3"></span><span id="page-4-2"></span>

**FIGURE 3.** Determination of the optimal threshold based on the value of Mcc.

Next, the associated receiver operating characteristic (ROC) curve and system operating point, which is related to the aforementioned optimal threshold, were calculated for the test set (Fig. [4\)](#page-5-1). In this case, the Mcc was 0.67 and at this point the sensitivity and specificity were 0.90 and 0.76, respectively.

#### *b: MODULE TWO—PROGNOSTIC*

<span id="page-4-7"></span><span id="page-4-1"></span>As previously mentioned, if the patient is diagnosed with pneumonia by the first system module, they are then moved on to the second module which attempts to quantify the ASOS. Given the small number of CXRs available (200), in this case we decided to integrate an already trained model, the COVID-Net CXR-S, into module two. The latter is a CNN developed by Wang et al. [\[38\],](#page-10-8) [\[44\], t](#page-10-14)o predict ASOS in patients that tested positive for COVID-19 based on a

<span id="page-5-1"></span>

**FIGURE 4.** The receiver operating characteristic curve for the test set with the optimal operating point highlighted.

<span id="page-5-4"></span>CXR image, which is available for public use in a GitHub repository [\[45\]. F](#page-10-15)or their training and implementation, the authors used Keras with the following hyperparameters [\[44\]:](#page-10-14) learning rate  $= 0.0002$ , number of epochs  $= 22$  and batch  $size = 64$ . In this present case, the images had to be rescaled to  $480 \times 480 \times 1$  to match the dimensions of the COVID-Net CXR-S input layer.

The RMSE (root mean square error), the square root of the sum of the square of the residuals between the real value and the value predicted by the model, is often used to quantify the precision of regression models. The equation to calculate RMSE is shown in equation [\(2\)](#page-5-2) and ideally, the lower this value, the better the fit.

RMSE = 
$$
\sqrt{\frac{1}{m} \sum_{i=1}^{m} (Real value_i - Predicted value_i)^2}
$$
 (2)

A RMSE of 6.14 was obtained in the tests carried out with COVID-Net CXR-S using our set of 200 patients. Thus, given that the variable to be predicted varies between 0 and 24, we understood that there was a moderate level of error in relation to the total range of the variable. Nonetheless, in the future it would be advisable to fine-tune this already trained model if a larger database is available.

# 3) ALERT GENERATION AND DECISION MAKING

After analysis of the CXR, the PR and ASOS scores are obtained and the associated alerts are generated based on their interpretation, as shown in Fig. [2,](#page-3-0) panel 3.

#### <span id="page-5-0"></span>**III. CASE STUDY**

This section presents a practical application case to provide an example of how the system operates. This is essentially a proof of concept and in no case is intended to validate the tool or compare it with other existing state-of-the-art tools. The system must be validated through its intensive and controlled use in real environments, where it will be possible to analyse its clinical usefulness. However, it is important to note that the data used in this example was from a test set independent of the system training and validation sets.

# A. INITIAL EVALUATION AND CHEST X-RAYS

From among the patients available in the test set, a patient with pneumonia was selected at random. Data from this patient was not used in the process of constructing the system. The patient was a 65-year-old woman and the CXR from this case is shown in Fig. [5.](#page-5-3)

<span id="page-5-3"></span>

**FIGURE 5.** The chest X-ray of the example patient under study.

<span id="page-5-2"></span>The patient had been evaluated upon arrival at the emergency department and had tested positive for COVID-19; her CXR was classified as positive for pneumonia. In turn, after independently evaluating the CXR, two thoracic radiologists rated the ASOS at 9 points.

# B. DATA PROCESSING

Once the patient image was loaded into the system, its analysis was undertaken by clicking the 'calculate' button in panel 2 of the application. Next, the PR and ASOS were obtained, producing values of 100 and 9.93, respectively, as shown in Fig. [6.](#page-6-1)

#### C. ALERT GENERATION AND DECISION MAKING

Analysis of the image identified a PR exceeding the preset threshold, thereby generating the Pneumonia label. Subsequent analysis by the second module revealed that the patient had an ASOS rated at approximately 10 points. According to the predefined rules for the classification and management of patients based on the ASOS in the context of this system, this specific patient case fell within the range that advises hospitalisation (5 < ASOS < 15). Therefore, hospital admission was proposed by the system with the aim of

<span id="page-6-1"></span>

**FIGURE 6.** Screenshot of the case study.

providing the patient with adequate treatment and to closely monitor her health status. In this case, these predictions were consistent with the actual clinical labels for the patient and its recommendation also aligned with the clinical practices suggested by the attending clinicians.

#### <span id="page-6-0"></span>**IV. DISCUSSION**

This article introduces the design, development, and proof of concept of a new intelligent decision support system supported by DL techniques applied to the interpretation of CXRs, with the aim of improving the management of patients with COVID-19 who come to the emergency services. The system we present here responds directly to the growing demands on healthcare services that have arisen from the COVID-19 pandemic while also helping to prepare us for potential future pandemic scenarios. By incorporating advanced DL technologies for image analysis, the proposed system not only optimises the accuracy and agility of the diagnosis of pneumonia, but also provides an assessment of the severity of patient conditions. This information is very important for efficient treatment and resource allocation, especially under conditions of high demand such as those experienced at the height of the recent pandemic. It is important to clarify that the associated severity of a given diagnosis should not only be considered when the patient arrives at the emergency department but should also facilitate their follow-up and monitoring. This would allow continuous optimisation of resources and prioritisation of more complex and costly interventions.

<span id="page-6-3"></span><span id="page-6-2"></span>Likewise, and unlike conventional methods that predominantly rely on the visual interpretation and judgment of radiologists, the proposed system introduces a quantitative and uniform methodology for the analysis of radiographs. In this sense, it is also worth highlighting the shortage of expert radiologists available to interpret CXRs [\[46\], a](#page-10-16) problem that further intensified during the COVID-19 pandemic. This deficit is such that, in some centres, these images are diagnosed by personnel less qualified than radiologists expert in CXRs [\[47\]. T](#page-10-17)hus, by automating the diagnosis and quantification of severity, the system presented here not only minimises interobserver discrepancies, but also alleviates the burden on health professionals who would then only have to validate the proposal made by the system, therefore streamlining their clinical practice. Therefore, once this system advances to later stages of development and is validated in real environments, it could be integrated into routine clinical practice to support radiologists in the diagnosis of patients with COVID-19 pneumonia. Thus, it would improve and simplify this task, especially for radiologists with less experience working with chest images. In addition, although the pandemic associated with COVID-19 seems to be subsiding and no new waves are expected, we believe that this proposed system could be used in pneumonias of other aetiologies with similar radiological presentations.

The system we designed was structured around two CNNs that work sequentially: the first seeks to identify pneumonia in a CXR image and the second, if applicable, quantifies the ASOS. Module one leverages the advantages of transfer

learning techniques by employing the Densenet-121 network, previously pretrained with the ImageNet dataset. The decision to use DenseNet-121 was based on careful consideration of its outstanding performance in previous work reported in the academic literature. For example, Kamal et al. compared eight pre-trained models on two different data sets and found that, with an accuracy of 98.69%, DenseNet-121 outperformed the others, with these authors also highlighting its ability in accurately classify COVID-19 in X-ray images[\[48\].](#page-10-18) Similarly, Kassania et al. [\[49\]](#page-10-19) evaluated DL-based feature extraction methods and recognised DenseNet121 as the most effective, achieving an accuracy of 99%. Furthermore, in binary and multiclass classification contexts, Hira et al. observed that DenseNet-121 achieved accuracies of 99.32% and 97.55%, respectively, outperforming other well-known CNN architectures [\[50\].](#page-10-20)

<span id="page-7-2"></span>Of note, transfer learning effectively solves one of the main challenges of DL: the lack of large, labelled data sets. Hence, by using this pre-trained model, our system benefited from prior learning and we were able to adapt it to detect specific patterns of COVID-19 pneumonia. This resulted in a robust and reliable model, with area under the curve (AUC) values exceeding 0.9, thus ensuring accurate diagnoses even with a reduced number of images.

As for the second module, the integration of COVID-Net CXR-S [\[38\], a](#page-10-8) model already validated by the scientific community, also provided reliable results, as confirmed when its use with our database resulted in a RMSE close to 6. Furthermore, the synergy of both models was particularly beneficial: the system not only distinguished between the presence and absence of pneumonia, but also provided an estimate of the disease severity based on ASOS. This approach would significantly enrich the clinical decision-making process, providing a more complete and nuanced view of the condition of each patient.

The quality and uniformity of the database used are crucial for the development of coherent and effective DL models. Most state-of-the-art work has employed databases available on the internet, thereby mixing patient cases collected under different conditions. This aspect represents one of the outstanding strengths of this present study: we used our own exceptionally curated database, compiled by us at the Ribera Povisa Hospital. The images we included were collected using the same radiography equipment, were labelled following a standardised protocol, and was reviewed by two expert radiologists to ensure accuracy and consistency.

The proof of concept results we obtained underline the effectiveness of the system to differentiate between patients with and without pneumonia and to accurately quantify disease severity, consistently aligning with evaluations performed by expert radiologists. The high agreement between system-generated scores and expert assessments not only confirmed the validity of the approach, but also highlighted the potential ability of the model to function as a reliable tool in clinical settings. In any case, once the system advances to later stages of development, intensive clinical validation in real-world settings will be required prior to its clinical use.

Implementing advanced metrics such as the Mcc to optimise the pneumonia detection threshold further enhanced the accuracy and reliability of the system. In particular, the use of the Mcc provides a robust measure of model performance with imbalanced data sets, ensuring that the system maintains a high level of accuracy in identifying pneumonia cases, even when the distribution of classes is not uniform. In this context, the Mcc value of 0.67 we obtained for module one highlights the remarkable predictive ability of the system, underlining its effectiveness even in challenging diagnostic scenarios.

<span id="page-7-1"></span><span id="page-7-0"></span>Therefore, in our opinion, the proposed system has considerable potential to optimise the response capacity of health systems when facing the COVID-19 pandemic or other similar situations. Thus, offering this tool as an effective means for rapid and accurate diagnosis positions it as a valuable resource in the clinical management of COVID-19. Given the innovative nature of this technology and the constant advances in the field of DL, it would be interesting to expand and enrich our database with new cases, which would not only improve the robustness and capacity of the model for generalisation but would also allow a broader range of clinical manifestations of the disease to be captured. Furthermore, exploring new CNN architectures in this context may reveal more efficient and accurate approaches to medical image processing and analysis.

# A. LIMITATIONS

Despite the promising results we have obtained in this study, there are several limitations to this work that should be acknowledged:

- Conceptual development phase: Our system is in the concept development stage at the moment and this work is an important benchmark where we showed the utility of the system with a proof of concept. However, COVID-19 is currently under control and it does not seem foreseeable that new waves like those experienced in the past will occur again which, to some extent, will make it difficult to validate this model in real situations in which the radiology service is put under such high levels of demand.
- It should be mentioned that our study was carried out using the data from the Ribera Povisa Hospital (Vigo, Galicia, Spain), and one of the strengths of our study may also be one of its limitations – the size, variability and quality of the database. The sample may not be representative of the variability associated with COVID-19 in different populations because only one hospital database was used. In addition, although we tried to minimise inter-observer variability by having two expert radiologists perform the assessments, there was a degree of dependence on visual interpretation of the images, which could have introduced some variability and error in the definition of the labels.



#### <span id="page-8-1"></span>**TABLE 2.** Benchmarking.

• Transfer learning and black box models: In module 1 (diagnosis), a pre-trained CNN adapted for prediction with radiographs was used. Although transfer learning strategies were very useful for reducing training times and the volume of data required, they can also limit the versatility of the model. Furthermore, although CNNs are very effective for image analysis tasks, they are black box models that lack explainability. Thus, this lack of transparency may limit confidence and adoption by healthcare professionals.

# B. BENCHMARKING

To facilitate understanding of the usefulness and relevance of our proposal, a detailed comparison with existing stateof-the-art work is presented in Table [2.](#page-8-1) This comparison considers three criteria, the first focusing on systems that focus exclusively on diagnosis, the second on those that focus solely on prognosis, and the third on those that simultaneously focus on both aspects (diagnosis and prognosis).

In general, most of the work previously published in the academic literature and shown in Table [2](#page-8-1) focused on one of these two areas (diagnosis or prognosis) but did not integrate them both. This serves to highlight the novelty of the tool proposed in this current work, which is more versatile than the state of the art tools already available.

#### <span id="page-8-0"></span>**V. CONCLUSION**

The diagnostic capacity of the system described in this work aligned with the evaluations of expert radiologists and therefore presented enormous potential as a critical resource in the management of the COVID-19 pandemic. The use of our own database, together with the application of transfer learning techniques with DenseNet-121 and the implementation of advanced metrics such as Mcc, further strengthened the reliability and applicability of the system. Despite these advances, we must acknowledge that the system is in the early stages of development and that in the future, intensive clinical validations in real settings will be required prior to its clinical use to ensure the robustness and generalisability of the proposed system. In any case, COVID-19 is currently under control and it seems unlikely that new waves of infection like those experienced in 2022 and 2023 will occur again. Thus, to a certain extent, this makes it difficult to execute validation tests for this current proposal in real environments. Nonetheless, this is not a problem because the system could be useful in possible future pandemics and could be adapted for other diseases or pneumonias of other aetiologies with similarities in terms of their radiological presentation. If such validation is possible, cost-effectiveness analyses should also be undertaken in the future to understand the real benefit associated with its use. In turn, the interpretation of DL models and confidence in their results is an area that will require continued attention, suggesting that AI explainability methods should also be explored. In future work we plan to integrate a new module into this system which will employ techniques to make its predictions more robust and explainable. Hence, we hope that combining these techniques with the specific knowledge of specialists will lead to consistent clinical interpretations that will positively impact decision-making processes and generate more confidence among clinicians, thereby favouring its use.

#### **GLOSSARY OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

- Airspace opacity severity: ASOS
- Anteroposterior: AP
- Artificial Intelligence: AI
- Area under the curve: AUC
- Chest X-ray: CXR
- Convolutional Neural Networks: CNNs
- Deep learning: DL
- Digital Imaging and Communication In Medicine:  $DICOM(R)$
- False negatives: FN
- False positives: FP
- Intensive care unit: ICU
- Matthews correlation coefficient: Mcc
- Picture Archiving and Communication System: PACS
- Pneumonia risk: PR
- Polymerase chain reaction: PCR
- Posteroanterior: PA
- Receiver operating characteristic: ROC
- Root mean square error: RMSE
- True negatives: TN
- True positives: TP

#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENT**

This research was conducted as part of the doctoral work carried out with the Epidemiology Department, University of Santiago de Compostela. The co-author Manuel Sánchez-Montañés has been supported by grants PID2021- 122347NB-I00 and PID2021-127946OB-I00 (funded by MCIN/AEI//10.13039/ 501100011033 and ERDF ''A way of making Europe'').

#### **REFERENCES**

- <span id="page-9-0"></span>[\[1\] M](#page-1-0). Ciotti, M. Ciccozzi, A. Terrinoni, W.-C. Jiang, C.-B. Wang, and S. Bernardini, ''The COVID-19 pandemic,'' *Crit. Rev. Clin. Lab. Sci.*, vol. 57, no. 6, pp. 365–388, Aug. 2020, doi: [10.1080/10408363.2020.1783198.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10408363.2020.1783198)
- <span id="page-9-1"></span>[\[2\] J](#page-1-1). Mattsson, E. Hedlund, L. George-Svahn, E. Scheers-Andersson, M. Mazaheri, and G. Björling, ''Nurses' experiences of caring for patients with suspected or confirmed COVID-19 in the initial stage of the pandemic,'' *Sage J.*, vol. 8, pp. 1–11, Jul. 2022, doi: [10.1177/23779608221114981.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/23779608221114981)
- <span id="page-9-2"></span>[\[3\] G](#page-1-2). Grasselli, A. Pesenti, and M. Cecconi, ''Critical care utilization for the COVID-19 outbreak in lombardy, italy: Early experience and forecast during an emergency response,'' *JAMA*, vol. 323, no. 16, p. 1545, Apr. 2020, doi: [10.1001/jama.2020.4031.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.4031)
- <span id="page-9-3"></span>[\[4\] S](#page-1-3). M. Bartsch, M. C. Ferguson, J. A. McKinnell, K. J. O'Shea, P. T. Wedlock, S. S. Siegmund, and B. Y. Lee, ''The potential health care costs and resource use associated with COVID-19 in the United States,'' *Health Affairs*, vol. 39, no. 6, pp. 927–935, Jun. 2020, doi: [10.1377/hlthaff.2020.00426.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1377/hlthaff.2020.00426)
- <span id="page-9-4"></span>[\[5\] M](#page-1-4). L. Ranney, V. Griffeth, and A. K. Jha, ''Critical supply shortages—The need for ventilators and personal protective equipment during the COVID-19 pandemic,'' *New England J. Med.*, vol. 382, no. 18, p. e41, Apr. 2020, doi: [10.1056/nejmp2006141.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1056/nejmp2006141)
- <span id="page-9-5"></span>[\[6\] G](#page-1-5). D. Rubin et al., ''The role of chest imaging in patient management during the COVID-19 pandemic: A multinational consensus statement from the Fleischner society,'' *Radiology*, vol. 296, no. 1, pp. 172–180, Jul. 2020, doi: [10.1148/radiol.2020201365.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1148/radiol.2020201365)
- <span id="page-9-6"></span>[\[7\] T](#page-1-6). Ai, Z. Yang, H. Hou, C. Zhan, C. Chen, W. Lv, Q. Tao, Z. Sun, and L. Xia, ''Correlation of chest CT and RT-PCR testing for coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in China: A report of 1014 cases,'' *Radiology*, vol. 296, no. 2, pp. E32–E40, Aug. 2020, doi: [10.1148/radiol.2020200642.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1148/radiol.2020200642)
- <span id="page-9-7"></span>[\[8\] H](#page-1-7). X. Bai, B. Hsieh, Z. Xiong, K. Halsey, J. W. Choi, T. M. L. Tran, I. Pan, L.-B. Shi, D.-C. Wang, J. Mei, X.-L. Jiang, Q.-H. Zeng, T. K. Egglin, P.-F. Hu, S. Agarwal, F.-F. Xie, S. Li, T. Healey, M. K. Atalay, and W.-H. Liao, ''Performance of radiologists in differentiating COVID-19 from Non-COVID-19 viral pneumonia at chest CT,'' *Radiology*, vol. 296, no. 2, pp. E46–E54, Aug. 2020, doi: [10.1148/radiol.2020200823.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1148/radiol.2020200823)
- <span id="page-9-8"></span>[\[9\] M](#page-1-8). Casal-Guisande, L. Ceide-Sandoval, M. Mosteiro-Añón, M. Torres-Durán, J. Cerqueiro-Pequeño, J.-B. Bouza-Rodríguez, A. Fernández-Villar, and A. Comesaña-Campos, ''Design of an intelligent decision support system applied to the diagnosis of obstructive sleep apnea,'' *Diagnostics*, vol. 13, no. 11, p. 1854, May 2023, doi: [10.3390/](http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/diagnostics13111854) [diagnostics13111854.](http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/diagnostics13111854) [Online]. Available: https://www.preprints.org/ manuscript/202303.0470/v1
- <span id="page-9-9"></span>[\[10\]](#page-1-9) G. Wu et al., "Development of a clinical decision support system for severity risk prediction and triage of COVID-19 patients at hospital admission: An international multicenter study,'' *Eur. Respiratory J.*, vol. 56, no. 2, Jul. 2020, Art. no. 2001104, doi: [10.1183/13993003.01104-2020.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1183/13993003.01104-2020)
- <span id="page-9-10"></span>[\[11\]](#page-1-10) M. Casal-Guisande, M. Torres-Durán, M. Mosteiro-Añón, J. Cerqueiro-Pequeño, J.-B. Bouza-Rodríguez, A. Fernández-Villar, and A. Comesaña-Campos, ''Design and conceptual proposal of an intelligent clinical decision support system for the diagnosis of suspicious obstructive sleep apnea patients from health profile,'' *Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health*, vol. 20, no. 4, p. 3627, Feb. 2023, doi: [10.3390/ijerph20043627.](http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/ijerph20043627)
- <span id="page-9-11"></span>[\[12\]](#page-1-11) M. Casal-Guisande, A. Álvarez-Pazó, J. Cerqueiro-Pequeño, J.-B. Bouza-Rodríguez, G. Peláez-Lourido, and A. Comesaña-Campos, ''Proposal and definition of an intelligent clinical decision support system applied to the screening and early diagnosis of breast cancer,'' *Cancers*, vol. 15, no. 6, p. 1711, Mar. 2023, doi: [10.3390/cancers15061711.](http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/cancers15061711)
- <span id="page-9-12"></span>[\[13\]](#page-1-12) S. Nazari, M. Fallah, H. Kazemipoor, and A. Salehipour, ''A fuzzy inference- fuzzy analytic hierarchy process-based clinical decision support system for diagnosis of heart diseases,'' *Exp. Syst. Appl.*, vol. 95, pp. 261–271, Apr. 2018, doi: [10.1016/j.eswa.2017.11.001.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2017.11.001)
- <span id="page-9-13"></span>[\[14\]](#page-1-13) M. Casal-Guisande, A. Comesaña-Campos, I. Dutra, J. Cerqueiro-Pequeño, and J.-B. Bouza-Rodríguez, ''Design and development of an intelligent clinical decision support system applied to the evaluation of breast cancer risk,'' *J. Personalized Med.*, vol. 12, no. 2, p. 169, Jan. 2022, doi: [10.3390/jpm12020169.](http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/jpm12020169)
- <span id="page-9-14"></span>[\[15\]](#page-1-14) X. Jiang, A. Wells, A. Brufsky, and R. Neapolitan, "A clinical decision support system learned from data to personalize treatment recommendations towards preventing breast cancer metastasis,'' *PLoS ONE*, vol. 14, no. 3, Mar. 2019, Art. no. e0213292, doi: [10.1371/journal.pone.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0213292) [0213292.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0213292)
- <span id="page-9-15"></span>[\[16\]](#page-1-15) M. E. Cooley, T. M. Blonquist, P. J. Catalano, D. F. Lobach, B. Halpenny, R. McCorkle, E. B. Johns, I. M. Braun, M. S. Rabin, F. Z. Mataoui, K. Finn, D. L. Berry, and J. L. Abrahm, ''Feasibility of using algorithm-based clinical decision support for symptom assessment and management in lung cancer,'' *J. Pain Symptom Manage.*, vol. 49, no. 1, pp. 13–26, Jan. 2015, doi: [10.1016/j.jpainsymman.2014.05.003.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jpainsymman.2014.05.003)
- <span id="page-9-16"></span>[\[17\]](#page-1-16) F. Hamedan, A. Orooji, H. Sanadgol, and A. Sheikhtaheri, ''Clinical decision support system to predict chronic kidney disease: A fuzzy expert system approach,'' *Int. J. Med. Informat.*, vol. 138, Jun. 2020, Art. no. 104134, doi: [10.1016/j.ijmedinf.2020.104134.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijmedinf.2020.104134)
- <span id="page-9-17"></span>[\[18\]](#page-1-17) A. Courbis et al., "Electronic clinical decision support system for allergic rhinitis management: MASK e-CDSS,'' *Clin. Experim. Allergy*, vol. 48, no. 12, pp. 1640–1653, Dec. 2018, doi: [10.1111/cea.13230.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/cea.13230)
- <span id="page-9-18"></span>[\[19\]](#page-1-18) L. K. Singh, M. Khanna, and R. Singh, ''Artificial intelligence based medical decision support system for early and accurate breast cancer prediction,'' *Adv. Eng. Softw.*, vol. 175, Jan. 2023, Art. no. 103338, doi: [10.1016/j.advengsoft.2022.103338.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.advengsoft.2022.103338)
- <span id="page-9-19"></span>[\[20\]](#page-1-19) R. T. Sutton, D. Pincock, D. C. Baumgart, D. C. Sadowski, R. N. Fedorak, and K. I. Kroeker, ''An overview of clinical decision support systems: Benefits, risks, and strategies for success,'' *NPJ Digit. Med.*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 1–10, Feb. 2020, doi: [10.1038/s41746-020-0221-y.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/s41746-020-0221-y)
- <span id="page-9-20"></span>[\[21\]](#page-1-20) M. Fernandes, S. M. Vieira, F. Leite, C. Palos, S. Finkelstein, and J. M. C. Sousa, ''Clinical decision support systems for triage in the emergency department using intelligent systems: A review,'' *Artif. Intell. Med.*, vol. 102, Jan. 2020, Art. no. 101762, doi: [10.1016/j.artmed.2019.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.artmed.2019.101762) [101762.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.artmed.2019.101762)
- <span id="page-9-21"></span>[\[22\]](#page-1-21) M. Casal-Guisande, A. Comesaña-Campos, J. Cerqueiro-Pequeño, and J.-B. Bouza-Rodríguez, ''Design and development of a methodology based on expert systems, applied to the treatment of pressure ulcers,'' *Diagnostics*, vol. 10, no. 9, p. 614, Aug. 2020, doi: [10.3390/diagnostics10090614.](http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/diagnostics10090614)
- <span id="page-9-22"></span>[\[23\]](#page-1-22) P. Rajpurkar and M. P. Lungren, "The current and future state of AI interpretation of medical images,'' *New England J. Med.*, vol. 388, no. 21, pp. 1981–1990, May 2023, doi: [10.1056/nejmra2301725.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1056/nejmra2301725)
- <span id="page-9-23"></span>[\[24\]](#page-1-23) G. Choy, O. Khalilzadeh, M. Michalski, S. Do, A. E. Samir, O. S. Pianykh, J. R. Geis, P. V. Pandharipande, J. A. Brink, and K. J. Dreyer, ''Current applications and future impact of machine learning in radiology,'' *Radiology*, vol. 288, no. 2, pp. 318–328, Jun. 2018, doi: [10.1148/RADIOL.2018171820](http://dx.doi.org/10.1148/RADIOL.2018171820)
- <span id="page-9-24"></span>[\[25\]](#page-1-24) S. M. Lee, J. B. Seo, J. Yun, Y.-H. Cho, J. Vogel-Claussen, M. L. Schiebler, W. B. Gefter, E. J. R. van Beek, J. M. Goo, K. S. Lee, H. Hatabu, J. Gee, and N. Kim, ''Deep learning applications in chest radiography and computed tomography,'' *J. Thoracic Imag.*, vol. 34, no. 2, pp. 75–85, Mar. 2019, doi: [10.1097/rti.0000000000000387.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1097/rti.0000000000000387)
- <span id="page-9-25"></span>[\[26\]](#page-1-25) M. D. C. Abelaira, A. Ruano-Ravina, and A. Fernández-Villar, "Inteligencia artificial en radiología torácica. Un reto en tiempos de la COVID-19? Artificial intelligence in thoracic radiology. A challenge in COVID-19 Times?'' *Archivos de Bronconeumología*, vol. 57, pp. 15–16, Oct. 2020, doi: [10.1016/J.ARBRES.2020.10.008.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/J.ARBRES.2020.10.008)
- <span id="page-9-26"></span>[\[27\]](#page-1-26) Y. Lecun, Y. Bengio, and G. Hinton, ''Deep learning,'' *Nature*, vol. 7553, no. 521, pp. 436–444, May 2015, doi: [10.1038/nature14539.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nature14539)
- <span id="page-9-27"></span>[\[28\]](#page-1-27) B. Fernando, *Redes Neuronales & Deep Learning*. Granada, Spain: Independently Published, 2018.
- <span id="page-9-28"></span>[\[29\]](#page-1-28) A. Narin, C. Kaya, and Z. Pamuk, ''Automatic detection of coronavirus disease (COVID-19) using X-ray images and deep convolutional neural networks,'' *Pattern Anal. Appl.*, vol. 24, no. 3, pp. 1207–1220, Aug. 2021, doi: [10.1007/s10044-021-00984-y.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10044-021-00984-y)
- <span id="page-10-0"></span>[\[30\]](#page-1-29) K. Sahinbas and F. O. Catak, "24—Transfer learning-based convolutional neural network for COVID-19 detection with X-ray images,'' in *Data Science for COVID-19*, Jan. 2021, pp. 451–466, doi: [10.1016/B978-0-12-](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-824536-1.00003-4) [824536-1.00003-4.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-824536-1.00003-4)
- <span id="page-10-1"></span>[\[31\]](#page-1-30) K. Medhi, M. Jamil, and M. I. Hussain, ''Automatic detection of COVID-19 infection from chest X-ray using deep learning,'' *medRxiv*, May 2020, doi: [10.1101/2020.05.10.20097063.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1101/2020.05.10.20097063)
- <span id="page-10-2"></span>[\[32\]](#page-1-31) T. Ozturk, M. Talo, E. A. Yildirim, U. B. Baloglu, O. Yildirim, and U. Rajendra Acharya, ''Automated detection of COVID-19 cases using deep neural networks with X-ray images,'' *Comput. Biol. Med.*, vol. 121, Jun. 2020, Art. no. 103792, doi: [10.1016/j.compbiomed.2020.103792.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.compbiomed.2020.103792)
- <span id="page-10-3"></span>[\[33\]](#page-1-32) R. G. Babukarthik, D. Chandramohan, D. Tripathi, M. Kumar, and G. Sambasivam, ''COVID-19 identification in chest X-ray images using intelligent multi-level classification scenario,'' *Comput. Electr. Eng.*, vol. 104, Dec. 2022, Art. no. 108405, doi: [10.1016/j.compeleceng.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.compeleceng.2022.108405) [2022.108405.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.compeleceng.2022.108405)
- <span id="page-10-4"></span>[\[34\]](#page-1-33) M. D. Li, N. T. Arun, M. Gidwani, K. Chang, F. Deng, B. P. Little, D. P. Mendoza, M. Lang, S. I. Lee, A. O'Shea, A. Parakh, P. Singh, and J. Kalpathy-Cramer, ''Automated assessment and tracking of COVID-19 pulmonary disease severity on chest radiographs using convolutional Siamese neural networks,'' *Radiology: Artif. Intell.*, vol. 2, no. 4, Jul. 2020, Art. no. e200079, doi: [10.1148/ryai.2020200079.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1148/ryai.2020200079)
- <span id="page-10-5"></span>[\[35\]](#page-1-34) J. Zhu, B. Shen, A. Abbasi, M. Hoshmand-Kochi, H. Li, and T. Q. Duong, ''Deep transfer learning artificial intelligence accurately stages COVID-19 lung disease severity on portable chest radiographs,'' *PLoS ONE*, vol. 15, no. 7, Jul. 2020, Art. no. e0236621, doi: [10.1371/journal.pone.0236621.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0236621)
- <span id="page-10-6"></span>[\[36\]](#page-2-2) A. Borghesi, A. Zigliani, R. Masciullo, S. Golemi, P. Maculotti, D. Farina, and R. Maroldi, ''Radiographic severity index in COVID-19 pneumonia: Relationship to age and sex in 783 Italian patients,'' *La Radiologia Medica*, vol. 125, no. 5, pp. 461–464, May 2020, doi: [10.1007/s11547-020-](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11547-020-01202-1) [01202-1.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11547-020-01202-1)
- <span id="page-10-7"></span>[\[37\]](#page-2-3) A. Borghesi and R. Maroldi, "COVID-19 outbreak in Italy: Experimental chest X-ray scoring system for quantifying and monitoring disease progression,'' *La Radiologia Medica*, vol. 125, no. 5, pp. 509–513, May 2020, doi: [10.1007/s11547-020-01200-3.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11547-020-01200-3)
- <span id="page-10-8"></span>[\[38\]](#page-3-1) A. Wong, Z. Q. Lin, L. Wang, A. G. Chung, B. Shen, A. Abbasi, M. Hoshmand-Kochi, and T. Q. Duong, ''Towards computer-aided severity assessment via deep neural networks for geographic and opacity extent scoring of SARS-CoV-2 chest X-rays,'' *Sci. Rep.*, vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 1–8, Apr. 2021, doi: [10.1038/s41598-021-88538-4.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-88538-4)
- <span id="page-10-9"></span>[\[39\]](#page-3-2) MathWorks. *MATLAB App Designer*. Accessed: Jan. 15, 2024. [Online]. Available: https://www.mathworks.com/products/MATLAB/appdesigner.html
- <span id="page-10-10"></span>[\[40\]](#page-4-3) G. Huang, Z. Liu, L. Van Der Maaten, and K. Q. Weinberger, ''Densely connected convolutional networks,'' in *Proc. IEEE Conf. Comput. Vis. Pattern Recognit. (CVPR)*, Jul. 2017, pp. 2261–2269, doi: [10.1109/CVPR.2017.243.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1109/CVPR.2017.243)
- <span id="page-10-11"></span>[\[41\]](#page-4-4) S. Boughorbel, F. Jarray, and M. El-Anbari, "Optimal classifier for imbalanced data using Matthews correlation coefficient metric,'' *PLoS ONE*, vol. 12, no. 6, Jun. 2017, Art. no. e0177678, doi: [10.1371/jour](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0177678)[nal.pone.0177678.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0177678)
- <span id="page-10-12"></span>[\[42\]](#page-4-5) D. Chicco and G. Jurman, "The advantages of the Matthews correlation coefficient (MCC) over F1 score and accuracy in binary classification evaluation,'' *BMC Genomics*, vol. 21, no. 1, pp. 1–13, Dec. 2020, doi: [10.1186/S12864-019-6413-7.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/S12864-019-6413-7)
- <span id="page-10-13"></span>[\[43\]](#page-4-6) J. P. Guilford, *Psychometric Methods*. New York, NY, USA: McGraw-Hill, 1954.
- <span id="page-10-14"></span>[\[44\]](#page-4-7) L. Wang, Z. Q. Lin, and A. Wong, "COVID-net: A tailored deep convolutional neural network design for detection of COVID-19 cases from chest X-ray images,'' *Sci. Rep.*, vol. 10, no. 1, pp. 1–12, Nov. 2020, doi: [10.1038/s41598-020-76550-z.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-76550-z)
- <span id="page-10-15"></span>[\[45\]](#page-5-4) L. Wang. *COVID-Net: COVID-Net Open Source Initiative*. Accessed: Jan. 26, 2024. [Online]. Available: https://github.com/lindawangg/ COVID-Net?tab=readme-ov-file
- <span id="page-10-16"></span>[\[46\]](#page-6-2) A. Rimmer, "Radiologist shortage leaves patient care at risk, warns royal college,'' *BMJ*, vol. 359, p. j4683, Oct. 2017, doi: [10.1136/bmj.j4683.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.j4683)
- <span id="page-10-17"></span>[\[47\]](#page-6-3) N. Woznitza, K. Piper, S. Rowe, and C. West, ''Optimizing patient care in radiology through team-working: A case study from the united kingdom,'' *Radiography*, vol. 20, no. 3, pp. 258–263, Aug. 2014, doi: [10.1016/j.radi.2014.02.007.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.radi.2014.02.007)
- <span id="page-10-18"></span>[\[48\]](#page-7-0) K. Kc, Z. Yin, M. Wu, and Z. Wu, "Evaluation of deep learning-based approaches for COVID-19 classification based on chest X-ray images,'' *Signal, Image Video Process.*, vol. 15, no. 5, pp. 959–966, Jul. 2021, doi: [10.1007/s11760-020-01820-2.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11760-020-01820-2)
- <span id="page-10-19"></span>[\[49\]](#page-7-1) S. H. Kassania, P. H. Kassanib, M. J. Wesolowskic, K. A. Schneidera, and R. Detersa, ''Automatic detection of coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in X-ray and CT images: A machine learning based approach,'' *Biocybernetics Biomed. Eng.*, vol. 41, no. 3, pp. 867–879, Jul. 2021, doi: [10.1016/j.bbe.2021.05.013.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.bbe.2021.05.013)
- <span id="page-10-20"></span>[\[50\]](#page-7-2) S. Hira, A. Bai, and S. Hira, ''An automatic approach based on CNN architecture to detect COVID-19 disease from chest X-ray images,'' *Appl. Intell.*, vol. 51, no. 5, pp. 2864–2889, May 2021, doi: [10.1007/S10489-](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/S10489-020-02010-W) [020-02010-W.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/S10489-020-02010-W)
- [\[51\]](#page-0-0) J. H. Chamberlin et al., "Automated diagnosis and prognosis of COVID-19 pneumonia from initial ER chest X-rays using deep learning,'' *BMC Infectious Diseases*, vol. 22, no. 1, pp. 1–13, Dec. 2022, doi: [10.1186/s12879-022-07617-7.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/s12879-022-07617-7)



DOLORES CORBACHO-ABELAIRA received the degree in medicine and surgery from the University of Santiago de Compostela. She is the Head of the Pulmonary Department, Hospital Ribera Povisa, Vigo, where she contributes to MIR training. She is an Active Member of the NeumoVigo I+i Research Group, Instituto de Investigación Sanitaria Galicia Sur. Her research is mainly focused on the use of artificial intelligence techniques in chest X-ray applica-

tions, a key component of her doctoral thesis. Her active involvement in the medical community includes lecturing at numerous accredited training courses for specialists and primary care providers, presenting at national and international congresses, and authoring articles in several prestigious journals. As a member of several professional societies, including the Spanish Society of Respiratory Pathology (SEPAR), the European Respiratory Society (ERS), and the Galician Society of Respiratory Pathology (SOGAPAR). She has made significant contributions to the field.



MANUEL CASAL-GUISANDE received the bachelor's degree in mechanical engineering and the master's and Ph.D. degrees in industrial engineering from the University of Vigo, in 2017, 2019, and 2023, respectively. He has recognized as the Student with the best academic record. He has undertaken several pre-doctoral stays during the Ph.D. study. His doctoral dissertation was developed with the Department of Design in Engineering, University of Vigo, and focused on the

design, development, and proof of concept of intelligent decision support systems applied to industrial settings, with a special focus on the healthcare domain. Since the defense of his doctoral dissertation, he was a Postdoctoral Researcher with the Fundación Biomédica Galicia Sur. Currently, he participates in a new research line with the NeumoVigo I+i Group, and focuses on the design and implementation of new intelligent systems applied to the diagnosis and treatment of respiratory diseases.



FERNANDO CORBACHO-ABELAIRA received the Ph.D. degree in computer science and systems neuroscience from the University of Southern California, 1997, under Dr. Michael A. Arbib. He is a Co-Founder and the Managing Partner of research and development with Cognodata Consulting, and leads all the projects on the application of AI in medicine. He is also a Co-Founder and a Board Member of Tinamica and MBIT School. He has also been a Professor with the Universidad

Autónoma de Madrid. He has published more than 80 scientific papers and has directed more than 100 projects dealing with the application and research of different AI technologies. He is the co-inventor of Schema-based learning, a new machine learning paradigm for AGI, and has used it to successfully analyses several physiological processes in different body structures.



MIGUEL ARNAIZ-FERNÁNDEZ received the master's degree in data science from CUNEF University, Madrid. His main research fields include computer vision using convolutional networks for medical diagnosis, task automation using autoML, and NLP processes with both LSTM networks and generative AI.



MANUEL SÁNCHEZ-MONTAÑÉS received the B.Sc. degree (Hons.) in physics from the Universidad Complutense de Madrid, Spain, in 1997, and the Ph.D. degree (cum laude) in computer science from the Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, Spain, in 2003. He is currently with the Computer Science Department, Universidad Autónoma de Madrid. His research activity is focused on artificial intelligence and advanced data analysis, carrying out theoretical developments and applications.



CARMEN TRINIDAD-LÓPEZ received the degree in medicine and surgery, with a specialization in radiodiagnostics, and the Ph.D. degree, with a thesis on the use of computed tomography in predicting and monitoring the response to treatment in non-small cell lung cancer. She completed a training program in chest radiology with the Royal Brompton Hospital, London. She is a doctor in medicine. Currently, she is an Adjunct Physician with the Radiology Department, Hospital Ribera

Povisa. Her expertise is evident in numerous publications, scientific communications, and participation in consensus projects. Throughout her career, she has actively contributed to scientific committees at both national and international conferences. She is a member of various medical societies, including the European Society of Radiology and the Spanish Society of Medical Radiology. She also holds the position of the Vice President of the Teaching Commission.



# CARLOS DELGADO SÁNCHEZ-GRACIÁN

received the degree in medicine and surgery, with a specialization in radiodiagnostics. He is an Adjunct Physician with the Radiology Department, Ribera Povisa Hospital. He also holds the position of a Residents Tutor. He has published numerous publications including several consensus projects. He is the President of the Spanish Society of Cardiothoracic Imaging. He is a member of the editorial board of the journal *Insight*

*into Imaging*, a Reviewer of the journal *Radiología*, and a member of the Scientific Committee of the Cardiothoracic Section in Congresses of the Spanish Society of Medical Radiology SERAM and the European Society of Radiology ESR.



ALBERTO RUANO-RAVIÑA is a Professor of preventive medicine and public health. He has published more than 300 articles in indexed journals and received two Fulbright grants to study the effects of indoor radon. His main research focused on lung cancer epidemiology and its risk factors.



ALBERTO FERNÁNDEZ-VILLAR received the Ph.D. degree in medicine from the University of Santiago.

He is the Head of the Pulmonary Department, Álvaro Cunqueiro Hospital, Vigo. As a Professor with the Biomedical Engineering Program, University of Vigo, he plays a key role in teaching and research. He coordinates the NeumoVigo I+i Group, Instituto de Investigación Sanitaria Galicia Sur; and the CB/23/06/00003 Group, Network

Research Centre, Carlos III Health Institute, Madrid, Spain. He is currently involved in projects related to care and clinical management, translational research, and promotion of innovation and teaching. He is the author of more than 300 publications of various types and clinical practice guidelines and more than 500 presentations at scientific meetings. He has led and managed a significant number of innovation and research projects with competitive funding and teaching activities and several doctoral theses in the field of respiratory diseases. His areas of special interests include respiratory infections, COPD, lung cancer, and innovation in health services. He has received more than 30 national awards and distinctions.

 $\sim$   $\sim$   $\sim$